DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 418 340 CG 028 354

AUTHOR Steward, Robbie J.; Giordano, Nancy G.; Goldsworthy, Sarah B.; Stallworth, Tamari C.; Stevens, Kerry L.

TITLE A Content Analysis of the Four Major Journals in Counseling Psychology: Biracial and Multiracial Literature over the Last Decade.

PUB DATE 1998-03-02

NOTE 16p.

PUB TYPE Information Analyses (070)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.

DESCRIPTORS Biculturalism; *Counseling; *Literature Reviews; *Racial Identification; Racial Relations; *Research Needs

IDENTIFIERS *Mixed Race Persons

ABSTRACT

This article presents the findings of a literature review conducted in order to assess the degree to which the biracial/multiracial population has been addressed in the four major journals of counseling psychology: "Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development," "Journal of Counseling and Development," "The Counseling Psychologist," and the "Journal of Counseling Psychology." Findings reveal that three of the four journals each published one relevant article in the 10 year period examined (1987-1996), suggesting a profound lack of knowledge of biracial/multiracial populations. Through a review of referenced sources outside of the scope of the study, four additional older empirical studies were located, all of which were dissertations or unpublished. A similar situation was found in other fields of study. An overview of the content of each article is presented. The authors strongly recommend that qualitative and quantitative research which examines the development and psychological adjustment of biracial/multiracial populations be encouraged. (EMK)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

CG

ED 418 340

A Content Analysis of the Four Major Journals in Counseling Psychology: Biracial and Multiracial Literature Over the Last Decade

Robbie J. Steward

Nancy G. Giordano, Sarah B. Goldsworthy, Tamari C. Stallworth, Kerry L. Stevens

Michigan State University

Department of Counseling and Educational Psychology

436 Erickson Hall

East Lansing, MI 48824

517-432-1524 (Office)

517-353-6393 (FAX)

devine@msu.edu

Submitted to be reviewed for publication in ERIC

March 2, 1998

All authors of this manuscript contributed equally to this research endeavor and consequently should be considered to share first authorship. We request that in all replications or references to this manuscript or any part of this manuscript, the name of each author is noted.

CG028354

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

☐ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

R. Steward

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Abstract

This article presents the findings of a literature review conducted in order to assess the degree to which the biracial/multiracial population has been addressed in the four major journals of counseling psychology: Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development (JMCD), Journal of Counseling and Development (JCD), The Counseling Psychologist (TCP), and the Journal of Counseling Psychology (JCP). Three articles were found in the ten year period examined (1987-1996). Analyses of each article, a presentation of references outside of the reviewed journals and recommendations for future research are presented.

A Content Analysis of the Four Major Journals in Counseling Psychology: A Discussion of What We Know and Don't Know About Literature Addressing the Biracial and Multiracial Population

INTRODUCTION

Historically, individuals of biracial/multiracial ethnicity have self-identified with one racial group. It was traditionally believed that, "biracial individuals who are the offspring of one White parent and one parent of color should identify with only one racial/ethnic group, specifically with the group of the parent of color" (Ponterotto, Casas, Suzuki & Alexander, 1996, p. 203). This attitude was reflected in the "one drop rule", which states a person with any genetic ties to the Black race is considered Black (Ponterotto et al., 1996). The mentality of the times forced biracial/multiracial group members to deny an integral part of their heritage.

More recently there is a growing population of individuals who choose to classify themselves as biracial or multiracial. However, there is no clearly defined category for these individuals to identify with outside of the five major racial groups (White, African American, Native American, Hispanic, and Asian). This has forced those who recognize themselves as a member of more than one race to select "other" as a descriptive category.

The recent change in cultural identification has created a controversy requiring counseling psychologists to move beyond traditional racial/ethnic identity to a new multiracial understanding. In order to work effectively in counseling with biracial/multiracial clients, counselors and educators need to address issues confronting this population. It is important to examine to what degree the current paradigm is reflected in counseling literature.

Content analyses have previously examined the representation of all racial/ethnic issues in counseling research (Bennett, Rowe & Hill, 1991; Ponterotto, 1986). The purpose of this study is to provide the first comprehensive content analysis pertaining specifically to biracial/multiracial issues in the four major journals in counseling psychology: Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development (JMCD), The Counseling Psychologist (TCP), Journal of Counseling and Development (JCD), and the Journal of Counseling Psychology (JCP). This study will focus on (a) examining the content of articles discussing biracial/multiracial issues, (b) identifying the leading contributors in terms of author and institutional affiliation, and (c) providing a descriptive profile of each article.

Due to the increase in individuals identifying themselves as biracial/multiracial, it is essential for professionals in the counseling field to further develop much needed biracial/multiracial cultural awareness. To become skilled professionals, an examination of the current body of knowledge, and lack of knowledge about this population needs to be conducted for the purpose of expanding future research and training.

METHOD

All articles published in the Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development (JMCD), Journal of Counseling and Development (JCD), The Counseling Psychologist (TCP) and Journal of Counseling Psychology (JCP), from 1987 through 1996 were reviewed examining the following variables: content of articles (topic areas addressed and particular biracial/multiracial groups discussed), descriptive profile of articles (design of study, characteristics of subjects, page length and number of citations) and author information (institutional affiliation, professional status and department/college). Data is highlighted in table form.

RESULTS

In the ten year period (1987-1996) examined in this study, three of the four major counseling journals (Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development, Journal of Counseling and Development and Journal of Counseling Psychology) published an article pertaining to biracial/multiracial populations. Table 1 presents the results of the review of the counseling literature addressing biracial/multiracial populations. A total of three articles were found in these major counseling journals: one qualitative study, one case study, and one conceptual/theoretical paper. No articles were found in The Counseling Psychologist.

(Table 1 inserted here.)

Table 2 presents a brief overview of the content addressed in each article. Four major topic areas were discussed within the three articles: self-concept, ethnic identity, psychosocial development and counseling implications.

(Table 2 inserted here.)

The particular biracial/multiracial group focused on in two of the articles was the black/white biracial population. The third article did not specify a particular biracial/multiracial population.

The Kerwin et al. (1993) article described a qualitative study of issues salient in the development of racial identity for school children of Black/White racial heritage. Semi-structured interviews were conducted individually with nine Black/White biracial children and their parents from six families. Findings indicated that biracial children and adolescents did not perceive themselves as 'marginal' in two cultures. Most of the participants reported valuing both the Black and White communities. Developmental transitions associated with different ages were identified.

The Poston (1990) article examined previous models of racial identity development, noting limitations in application to biracial individuals. A new model of biracial identity addressing personal identity, choice of group categorization, enmeshment/denial, appreciation, and integration was presented. Implications for counseling and clinical practice were also discussed.

The Brandell (1988) article presented a clinical illustration of a 7.5 year old biracial (Black/White) girl in psychotherapy. It is suggested that a self-psychological perspective would most effectively illuminate some aspects of the development of self-identity in the biracial child and serve to explain emotional problems experienced.

The number of participants in each study ranged from 1 to 9. The articles ranged in length from 4 to 12 pages, with a mean length of 7 pages.

Table 3 displays a descriptive profile of the authors of the articles. While there were only three articles, six authors and three institutions (Boston University, Fordham University, and the University of California, Santa Barbara) were represented. The authors' discipline areas were Counseling Psychology, School Psychology, Educational Administration, and Social Work.

(Table 3 inserted here.)

Table 4 presents the number of citations included in each article, specifically identifying the number directly addressing biracial/multiracial populations. The number of references provided ranged from 23 to 46, with a mean of 28. In terms of age groups, two articles addressed children and one addressed children and adolescents.

(Table 4 inserted here.)

Table 5 presents reference sources that specifically addressed biracial/multiracial populations. Currently there appears to be no one name uniquely associated with biracial/multiracial populations in any of the fields represented.

(Table 5 inserted here.)

~~DISCUSSION~~

Results from this review of the literature in counseling suggests the existence of very limited knowledge of biracial/multiracial populations. References in the three articles identified in this study included only two citations in the major counseling journals during 1985. (Note that the JMCD was once titled the Journal of Non-White Concerns in Personnel and Guidance and JCD was titled The Personnel and Guidance Journal). This suggests that the information cited in these articles may be somewhat outdated given the changes in society's way of identifying and addressing biracial/multiracial identity status among racial/ethnic minority populations. In addition, what is known appears to be somewhat limited to the experiences of children and adolescents with Black and White parents. This is particularly important to note, given that the Black/White combination represents only about 23% of the total population of interracial marriages (Poston, 1990).

Beyond the most current conceptual/theoretical development article, one case study and one qualitative study, the major journals in counseling have failed to specifically address the biracial/multiracial population. One possible explanation is researchers' and theorists' continuing attention to adding clarity to the meaning of the construct of racial and ethnic identity development and status of those who self-identify as mono-racial. Consequently empirical research targets the use of measures and theories addressing these critical issues as a means of

adding substantially to the literature addressing counseling competence with racial-ethnic minorities in general.

A second explanation for this scarce attention from researchers and practitioners within the profession is adherence to the belief of the "one drop rule", which is quite prevalent in the general population. Consequently, some might assume that issues relevant for biracial/multiracial children, adolescents, and adults are the same for those who are not. Though it would seem particularly important for counselors to better understand and to effectively respond to the issues of this 'normal' and well-represented segment of the general population, efforts to move in this direction are missing in the key counseling journals.

Though the reference sources reviewed found four older (1977, 1977, 1980, 1984) empirical studies linking racial/ethnic identity and the study of biracial/multiracial populations, all remained as dissertations or unpublished manuscripts. However, as a discipline, the profession of counseling does not appear to be alone in this oversight. Among the 19 references cited in the three most current articles found in this study, only six were professional journals representing four fields of study (Social Work, Education, Psychiatry, and Marriage & Family). Not one of these articles was written later than 1986, and no one identifiable author has been distinguished as an expert in the study of biracial/multiracial populations. The remainder of citations included magazine publications specifically targeting interracial relationships or racially mixed people in America.

Given this wide gap in the literature, the authors strongly recommend that the editors and editorial board members encourage the development of research that qualitatively and quantitatively examine the development and psychological adjustment of biracial/multiracial

populations in this country. Calls for papers for special issues and sections in counseling journals specifically addressing this population might be developed. Authors might commit to at least moving unpublished manuscripts to ERIC providing opportunities for broader distribution and easier access to colleagues. Both activities on the part of editorial boards and individual researchers will serve as encouragement of trainees' interest in work addressing this issue.

Closer examination of this population will lead to a clearer understanding of the uniqueness of those who are mono-racial, as well as those who are biracial/multiracial yet self-identify as mono-racial. Understanding these distinctions and how they might play out in the counseling process with racial/ethnic majority and minority group counselors would add significantly to the literature. Only then will the most effective assessments, ways of conceptualizing presenting concerns, and development of appropriate interventions evolve. Doing so would appear imperative given the Census data indicating that more American citizens are marrying outside their racial groups than ever before in the history of this nation. The profession of counseling must be better prepared to attend to the needs of this segment of the general population as well.

Table 1

Results of the Review of the Counseling Literature Addressing Biracial and Multiracial Populations

Journal	Article	Design
Journal of Counseling Psychology	Racial Identity in Biracial Children: A Qualitative Investigation	Qualitative
Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development	Treatment of the Biracial Child: Theoretical and Clinical Issues	Case Study
Journal of Counseling and Development	The Biracial Identity Development Model: A Needed Addition	Conceptual/Theoretical Paper
The Counseling Psychologist	None	None

Table 2

Content of Articles Reviewed

Article	Topic Area	Biracial Group Discussed
Racial Identity in Biracial Children: A Qualitative Investigation (JCP)	Ethnic Identity & Psychosocial Development	Black/White
Treatment of the Biracial Child: Theoretical and Clinical Issues (JMCD)	Individual Psychotherapy	Black/White
The Biracial Identity Development Model: A Needed Addition (JCD)	Models, Self-Concept & Ethnic Identity	Unspecified

Table 3
Author Information

Author	Institutional Affiliation	Professional Status*	Department/ College	Journal
Jerrold R. Brandell	Boston University	Associate Professor	School of Social Work	Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development
Abigail Harris	Fordham University	Associate Professor	School Psychology	Journal of Counseling Psychology
Barbara L. Jackson	Fordham University	Full Professor	Administration & Supervision	Journal of Counseling Psychology
Christine Kerwin	Fordham University	Ph.D.	Counseling Psychology	Journal of Counseling Psychology
Joseph G. Ponterotto	Fordham University	Full Professor	Counseling Psychology	Journal of Counseling Psychology
W.S. Carlos Poston	University of California, Santa Barbara	Ph.D.	Counseling Psychology	Journal of Counseling and Development

* Status of author at time of publication

Table 4
Profile of Article Citations

Journal	n Citations	n Biracial/Multiracial Citations	% of Citations with Biracial/multiracial Focus
Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development	23	8	35%
Journal of Counseling Psychology	46	14	30%
Journal of Counseling and Development	25	6	24%

Table 5

Reference Sources Specifically Addressing Biracial/Multiracial Populations

Source	Title	Author	Year
American Journal of Orthopsychiatry	Identity and Marginality: Issues in the Treatment of Biracial Adolescents	Gibbs, J.F.	1987
California Journal of Educational Research	The Self-Concept of Children of Ethnically Different Marriages	Chang, T.A.	1974
Children's Needs: Psychological Perspectives	Children and Biracial Identity	Adler, A.J.	1987
Dissertation Abstracts International	The Effects of Racial Identity on Self-Concept in Interracial Children	Arnold, M.C.	1984
Dissertation Abstracts International	Black/White Interracial Families: Marital Process and Identity Development in Young Children	Jacobs, J.H.	1977
Dissertation Abstracts International	Racial Attitude Formation in Children of Mixed Black and White Heritage: Skin Color and Racial Identity	Payne, R.	1977
Interracial Books for Children Bulletin	Providing a Healthy Environment for Interracial Children	Ladner, J.	1984
Interracial Books for Children Bulletin	Study of Interracial Children Presents Positive Picture	Poussaint, A.	1984

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Source	Title	Author	Year
Interracial Books for Children Bulletin	Considerations in Counseling Interracial Children	Sebring, D.	1985
Journal of Marriage and the Family	The Adjustment of Offspring of Within-group and Interracial/ Intercultural Marriages: A Comparison of Personality Factor Scores	Johnson, R.C. & Nagoshi, C.T.	1986
Journal of Non-White Concerns in Personnel and Guidance	Considerations in Counseling Interracial Children	Sebring, D.L.	1985
Journal of the American Academy of Psychiatry	Racial Identity and Self-Esteem: Problems Peculiar to Biracial Children	Lyles, M.R., Yancey, A., Grace, C., & Carter, J.H.	1985
Racially Mixed People in America	Identity Development in Biracial Children	Jacobs, J.H.	1992
Racially Mixed People in America	Back to the Drawing Board: Methodological Issues in Research on Multiracial People	Root, M.P.P.	1992
Social Work in Education	Racial Identity Issues Among Mixed-Race Children	McRoy, R. & Freeman, E.	1986
The Personnel and Guidance Journal	Considerations in Counseling Interracial Children	Sebring, D.L.	1985
Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation	The Ethnic Identity of Racially Mixed People: A Study of Black-Japanese	Hall, C.C.I.	1980

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Source	Title	Author	Year
Young Children	Are You Sensitive to Interracial Children's Special Identity Needs?	Wardle, F.	1987
Book	Black-White Interracial Families: Marital Process and Identity Development in Young Children	Jacobs, J.	1977

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

References

Bennett, S. K., Rowe, W., & Hill, T. L. (1991). A content analysis of the JMCD revisited: How are we doing five years later? Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development, 19, 98-104.

Brandell, J. R. (1988). Treatment of the biracial child: Theoretical and clinical issues. Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development, 16, 176-187.

Kerwin, C., Ponterotto, J. G., Jackson, B. L., & Harris, A. (1993). Racial identity in biracial children: A qualitative investigation. Journal of Counseling Psychology, 40(2), 221-231.

Ponterotto, J. G. (1986). A content analysis of the *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*. Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development, 98-107.

Poston, W. S. C. (1990). The biracial identity development model: A needed addition. Journal of Counseling and Development, 69, 152-155.